

Records of Meetings

Year: 2019

The following records of meetings have been approved by the Committee.
Signed
Listia.
Senator Kristina Moore
President
Scrutiny Liaison Committee

Record of Meeting

Meeting held by electronic mail

Date: 7th January 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore (President)
	Deputy Kirsten Morel(Vice-President)
	Senator Sarah Ferguson
	Connétable Mike Jackson
	Deputy Mary Le Hegarat
	Deputy Rob Ward
Apologies	
Absent	
In attendance	Tim Oldham (Assistant Greffier: Scrutiny)

Agenda matter	Action
1. Corporate Services Panel: Revenue Administration Law Review	
The Committee approved Terms of Reference and a Scoping Document for the Revenue Administration Law Review.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 31st January 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore (President)
	Senator Sarah Ferguson
	Deputy Mary Le Hegarat
	Deputy Rob Ward
Apologies	Deputy Kirsten Morel(Vice-President)
	Connétable Mike Jackson
Absent	
In attendance	Tim Oldham (Assistant Greffier: Scrutiny)

Agenda matter	Action
1. Minutes	
The Committee approved the records of its meetings held on 14th December 2018 and 7th January 2019	
2. Panel, PAC & Review Panel Activity Reports	
The Committee noted the activity reports for the Scrutiny Panels, PAC and the following Review Panels:	
 Brexit Care of Children Future Hospital Gender Pay Gap Legal Aid 	
3. Legislative Scrutiny	
Consideration was given to correspondence from the Chairman of PPC regarding the withdrawal of <u>P.103/2018 Draft Amendment (No. 37) of the Standing Orders of the States of Jersey</u> . The Chairman proposed that PPC would set up a subcommittee, which would include a representative from the Council of Ministers and from the Chairmen's Committee, to re-consider how the framework for legislative scrutiny could be enhanced.	
The Committee agreed to reply to the Chairman confirming its intention to participate with his proposed sub-committee, but to explain that capacity issues presented a current barrier to identifying a representative. The Committee would consider the matter further when all members were present, and update the Chairman in due course. In the meantime it would relay its concerns about the current proposals, notably the inclusion of 'backbench' propositions, insufficient timeframes and challenging staff resources.	
4. Panel Remits	
It was noted that the Committee's Proposition <u>P.4/2019 Draft Amendment (No. 39)</u> of the Standing Orders of the States of Jersey was scheduled to be debated by the States on 12th February.	
5. Scrutiny Budget and Staff Resources	

An update on budget and staff resources was provided to the Committee by the President and Assistant Greffier (Scrutiny). The Committee again expressed significant concern about a number of staff resource challenges and the direct impact this was having on Panel/Committee work. It was agreed that the President would seek to meet the Greffier of the States in order to discuss the current situation, ahead of raising the matter with the Chief Minister, seeking his support where appropriate, with ongoing efforts to resolve the challenges.	км/то
Due to reduced staff capacity it was agreed that the Health and Social Security Panel would temporarily defer further Review work upon completion of its Mental Health Review at the end of February, until the beginning of April. With the exception of approval given to a Review Panel examining the One Government project, it was further agreed to defer consideration of a number of other pending Review Panel proposals until the staff resource challenges had been sufficiently addressed.	
The Committee further agreed to request the Greffier of the States to attend its next meeting to discuss progress on budget and staff resources.	
6. Department for Strategic Policy, Performance and Population (SPPP)	
The Committee noted a presentation to the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel regarding the proposed structure (Target Operating Model) of SPPP.	
7. Liaison Meeting: President/Vice President and Chief Minister	
Matters to be raised by the President and Vice- President at the liaison meeting on 4th February with the Chief Minister were agreed as follows:	
 that Chief Exec should be asked to attend those meetings (or an appropriate deputy if necessary) budget and recruitment challenges 	
 proposal for a better public record of the Government's implementation of States' decisions and commitments made by Ministers in the States 	
8. Future Meeting	
The Committee noted the date of its next scheduled meeting: 28th February 2019, 10am to 12pm (Le Capelain Room).	

Record of Meeting

Meeting held by electronic mail

Date: 15th February 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore (President)
	Deputy Kirsten Morel(Vice-President)
	Senator Sarah Ferguson
	Connétable Mike Jackson
	Deputy Mary Le Hegarat
	Deputy Rob Ward
Apologies	
Absent	
In attendance	Tim Oldham (Assistant Greffier: Scrutiny)

Agenda matter	Action
Corporate Services Panel: Public Finances Law Sub-Panel Review	
The Committee approved Terms of Reference and a Scoping Document for the Public Finances Law Sub-Panel Review	

Record of Meeting

Date: 28th February 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore (President) Deputy Kirsten Morel(Vice-President) Senator Sarah Ferguson Connétable Mike Jackson Deputy Mary Le Hegarat Deputy Rob Ward
Apologies	Dopaty Nob Ward
Absent	
In attendance	Dr Mark Egan, Greffier of the States (Item 5 only)
	Andrew Metcalfe, Director - Strategic Policy, Performance and Population (Item 6 only)
	Anuschka Muller, Director of Corporate Planning and Performance (Item 6 only)
	Andrew Hacquoil, Director - Employment & Social Security (Item 6 only)
	Tim Oldham, Assistant Greffier: Scrutiny

Agenda matter	Action
1. Minutes	
The Committee approved the records of its meetings held on 31st January and 15th February 2019.	
2. Panel, PAC & Review Panel Activity Reports	
The Committee noted the activity reports for the Scrutiny Panels and PAC.	
Specific consideration was given to scrutiny of <i>P.17/2019 Draft Employment</i> (Amendment No.11) (Jersey) Law 201- (family friendly legislation), including: the clear remit interest of two Panels; Member and staff resources, particularly challenges on both aspects in respect of the Health and Social Security Panel; minimising the timeline for the required work, and; the scope of the necessary work. It was unanimously agreed, subject to ratification by the Health and Social Security Panel, that the most appropriate approach was for the Economic and International Affairs Panel to undertake a focused Review. For speed and transparency this decision was to be communicated to the Minister for Social Security without undue delay.	MLH/TO
The Committee further discussed a proposal from the Vice-President to enhance the Committee's approach to co-ordinating Scrutiny Reviews. It agreed to aim to compile a live, overarching worksheet of reviews and potential/forthcoming reviews, which would be considered at each meeting along with the individual activity reports. The Chairman of PAC proposed that its activity report might include an overview of the Comptroller and Auditor General's audit plan for additional context.	то
The Committee noted the activity reports for the following Review Panels:	

- Brexit
- Care of Children
- Future Hospital
- Gender Pay Gap
- Legal Aid

Noting the resignation of the Chairman of the Future Hospital Review Panel following presentation of its latest report on 8th February, due to ongoing workload challenges, the Committee agreed that the Review Panel would continue its work but that membership and terms of reference should be appraised and revised as required. As part of this process it was agreed that the existing scoping document and terms of reference would be re-circulated for the Committee's consideration.

TO

The Chairman of the Care of Children in Jersey Review Panel updated the Committee that the Review Panel was undertaking an examination of article 8 of the Draft Commissioner for Children and Young People (Jersey) Law 201- (Power of the Commissioner to request information) and had received several submissions highlighting concerns with the article. The Review Panel intended to call in the draft Law for further scrutiny under Standing Order 72 if the principles were adopted. It was anticipated that the Review Panel would consider bringing an amendment to the draft Law.

3. Privileges and Procedures Committee (PPC) Update

An update report on the work of PPC was noted.

4. Legislative Scrutiny

Correspondence sent by the President, as agreed on behalf of the Committee, to the Chairman of PPC regarding membership of the Sub-Committee examining this matter was noted.

5. Scrutiny Budget and Staff Resources

The Committee welcomed the Greffier of the States, who provided an update about Scrutiny staff and budget resources in response to the Committee's concerns regarding a number of ongoing challenges and their impact on Panel/Committee work.

The Committee welcomed the solutions identified by the States Greffe's Senior Leadership Team to address both the immediate issues that had arisen and the longer standing, structural problems. It was noted that the Committee would continue to be consulted on these matters, including the submission that was required to be made to PPC in respect of scrutiny funding in the new Government Plan.

The Committee thanked the Greffier for the information provided and for his time.

6. Department for Strategic Policy, Performance and Population (SPPP)

The Committee received a presentation from officers of the Department for Strategic Policy, Performance and Population on the process and timelines for producing the Government Plan 2020-23. The Committee thanked the Officers for the information provided and for their time.

7. Arms' Length Organisations

Consideration was given to identifying the most effective approach to possible scrutiny work relating to the States' relationship with Arms' Length Organisations (ALOs). It was understood that there was ongoing government work to review and revise Partnership Agreements and Memorandums of Understanding (MoUs). The Committee was mindful to ensure that Panels were suitably informed to identify any

appropriate scrutiny that should be undertaken, and to do so in a co-ordinated way to try to avoid unnecessary duplication to the benefit of all parties.	
It agreed to request relevant background information to help inform its understanding and decision making. Specifically this would include a full list of all ALOs, highlighting those whose MoU or Partnership Agreement was currently under review/revision or known to shortly be subject to such a process.	то
8. Future Meeting	
The Committee noted the date of its next scheduled meeting: 28th March 2019, 10am to 12pm (Le Capelain Room).	

Record of Meeting

Meeting held by electronic mail

Date: 6th March 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore (President)
	Deputy Kirsten Morel(Vice-President)
	Senator Sarah Ferguson
	Connétable Mike Jackson
	Deputy Mary Le Hegarat
	Deputy Rob Ward
Apologies	
Absent	
In attendance	Tim Oldham (Assistant Greffier: Scrutiny)

Agenda matter	Action
Economic and International Affairs Panel: P.17/2019 Draft Employment (Amendment No.11) (Jersey) Law 201- (family friendly legislation)	
The Committee approved the indicative Terms of Reference and a Scoping Document for the above Review.	

Record of Meeting

Meeting held by electronic mail

Date: 8th March 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore (President)	
	Deputy Kirsten Morel(Vice-President)	
	Senator Sarah Ferguson	
	Connétable Mike Jackson	
	Deputy Mary Le Hegarat	
	Deputy Rob Ward	
Apologies		
Absent		
In attendance	Tim Oldham (Assistant Greffier: Scrutiny)	

Agenda matter	Action
One Government Review Panel	
The Committee approved Terms of Reference and a Scoping Document for the Review.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 28th March 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore (President) Senator Sarah Ferguson Deputy Mary Le Hegarat Deputy Rob Ward
	Connétable John Le Maistre
Apologies	Connétable Mike Jackson
	Deputy Kirsten Morel(Vice-President)
Absent	
In attendance	Tim Oldham, Assistant Greffier: Scrutiny

The Committee approved the records of its meetings held on 28th February, 6th and 8th March 2019. 2. Panel, PAC & Review Panel Activity Reports The Committee noted the activity reports for the Scrutiny Panels, PAC and the following Review Panels: • Brexit • Care of Children • Future Hospital • Gender Pay Gap • Legal Aid The Committee considered the existing scoping document and terms of reference for the Future Hospital Review Panel. It agreed that in order to ensure the continued relevance and value of its work, the objectives of the Review Panel would be updated. Primary focus at this stage would be to focus on holding the Government to account for its current proposed action plan and associated timescales. It was further agreed that the membership of the Panel would comprise all members of the Chairmen's Committee and Connétable John Le Maistre. The Panel would seek to hold its regular administrative meetings at 12pm following each meeting of the Chairmen's Committee. 3. Privileges and Procedures Committee (PPC) Update An update report on the work of PPC was noted. The Committee discussed the value, status and timings of 'in committee' debates in the States Assembly. It was agreed that the Committee's representative to PPC, Deputy Le Hegarat, would relay a proposal that such debates might most effectively be held on a set day, Thursday, of States' meeting weeks. This was intended to ensure greater certainty that appropriate time and attention would be provided to	Agenda matter	Action
2. Panel, PAC & Review Panel Activity Reports The Committee noted the activity reports for the Scrutiny Panels, PAC and the following Review Panels: Brexit Care of Children Future Hospital Gender Pay Gap Legal Aid The Committee considered the existing scoping document and terms of reference for the Future Hospital Review Panel. It agreed that in order to ensure the continued relevance and value of its work, the objectives of the Review Panel would be updated. Primary focus at this stage would be to focus on holding the Government to account for its current proposed action plan and associated timescales. It was further agreed that the membership of the Panel would comprise all members of the Chairmen's Committee and Connétable John Le Maistre. The Panel would seek to hold its regular administrative meetings at 12pm following each meeting of the Chairmen's Committee. 3. Privileges and Procedures Committee (PPC) Update An update report on the work of PPC was noted. The Committee discussed the value, status and timings of 'in committee' debates in the States Assembly. It was agreed that the Committee's representative to PPC, Deputy Le Hegarat, would relay a proposal that such debates might most effectively be held on a set day, Thursday, of States' meeting weeks. This was intended to ensure greater certainty that appropriate time and attention would be provided to	1. Minutes	
The Committee noted the activity reports for the Scrutiny Panels, PAC and the following Review Panels: Brexit Care of Children Future Hospital Gender Pay Gap Legal Aid The Committee considered the existing scoping document and terms of reference for the Future Hospital Review Panel. It agreed that in order to ensure the continued relevance and value of its work, the objectives of the Review Panel would be updated. Primary focus at this stage would be to focus on holding the Government to account for its current proposed action plan and associated timescales. It was further agreed that the membership of the Panel would comprise all members of the Chairmen's Committee and Connétable John Le Maistre. The Panel would seek to hold its regular administrative meetings at 12pm following each meeting of the Chairmen's Committee. 3. Privileges and Procedures Committee (PPC) Update An update report on the work of PPC was noted. The Committee discussed the value, status and timings of 'in committee' debates in the States Assembly. It was agreed that the Committee's representative to PPC, Deputy Le Hegarat, would relay a proposal that such debates might most effectively be held on a set day, Thursday, of States' meeting weeks. This was intended to ensure greater certainty that appropriate time and attention would be provided to	8th March 2019.	
Following Review Panels: Brexit Care of Children Future Hospital Gender Pay Gap Legal Aid The Committee considered the existing scoping document and terms of reference for the Future Hospital Review Panel. It agreed that in order to ensure the continued relevance and value of its work, the objectives of the Review Panel would be updated. Primary focus at this stage would be to focus on holding the Government to account for its current proposed action plan and associated timescales. It was further agreed that the membership of the Panel would comprise all members of the Chairmen's Committee and Connétable John Le Maistre. The Panel would seek to hold its regular administrative meetings at 12pm following each meeting of the Chairmen's Committee. 3. Privileges and Procedures Committee (PPC) Update An update report on the work of PPC was noted. The Committee discussed the value, status and timings of 'in committee' debates in the States Assembly. It was agreed that the Committee's representative to PPC, Deputy Le Hegarat, would relay a proposal that such debates might most effectively be held on a set day, Thursday, of States' meeting weeks. This was intended to ensure greater certainty that appropriate time and attention would be provided to	2. Panel, PAC & Review Panel Activity Reports	
 Care of Children Future Hospital Gender Pay Gap Legal Aid The Committee considered the existing scoping document and terms of reference for the Future Hospital Review Panel. It agreed that in order to ensure the continued relevance and value of its work, the objectives of the Review Panel would be updated. Primary focus at this stage would be to focus on holding the Government to account for its current proposed action plan and associated timescales. It was further agreed that the membership of the Panel would comprise all members of the Chairmen's Committee and Connétable John Le Maistre. The Panel would seek to hold its regular administrative meetings at 12pm following each meeting of the Chairmen's Committee. 3. Privileges and Procedures Committee (PPC) Update An update report on the work of PPC was noted. The Committee discussed the value, status and timings of 'in committee' debates in the States Assembly. It was agreed that the Committee's representative to PPC, Deputy Le Hegarat, would relay a proposal that such debates might most effectively be held on a set day, Thursday, of States' meeting weeks. This was intended to ensure greater certainty that appropriate time and attention would be provided to 		
the Future Hospital Review Panel. It agreed that in order to ensure the continued relevance and value of its work, the objectives of the Review Panel would be updated. Primary focus at this stage would be to focus on holding the Government to account for its current proposed action plan and associated timescales. It was further agreed that the membership of the Panel would comprise all members of the Chairmen's Committee and Connétable John Le Maistre. The Panel would seek to hold its regular administrative meetings at 12pm following each meeting of the Chairmen's Committee. 3. Privileges and Procedures Committee (PPC) Update An update report on the work of PPC was noted. The Committee discussed the value, status and timings of 'in committee' debates in the States Assembly. It was agreed that the Committee's representative to PPC, Deputy Le Hegarat, would relay a proposal that such debates might most effectively be held on a set day, Thursday, of States' meeting weeks. This was intended to ensure greater certainty that appropriate time and attention would be provided to	 Care of Children Future Hospital Gender Pay Gap 	
of the Chairmen's Committee and Connétable John Le Maistre. The Panel would seek to hold its regular administrative meetings at 12pm following each meeting of the Chairmen's Committee. 3. Privileges and Procedures Committee (PPC) Update An update report on the work of PPC was noted. The Committee discussed the value, status and timings of 'in committee' debates in the States Assembly. It was agreed that the Committee's representative to PPC, Deputy Le Hegarat, would relay a proposal that such debates might most effectively be held on a set day, Thursday, of States' meeting weeks. This was intended to ensure greater certainty that appropriate time and attention would be provided to	the Future Hospital Review Panel. It agreed that in order to ensure the continued relevance and value of its work, the objectives of the Review Panel would be updated. Primary focus at this stage would be to focus on holding the Government	
An update report on the work of PPC was noted. The Committee discussed the value, status and timings of 'in committee' debates in the States Assembly. It was agreed that the Committee's representative to PPC, Deputy Le Hegarat, would relay a proposal that such debates might most effectively be held on a set day, Thursday, of States' meeting weeks. This was intended to ensure greater certainty that appropriate time and attention would be provided to	of the Chairmen's Committee and Connétable John Le Maistre. The Panel would seek to hold its regular administrative meetings at 12pm following each meeting of	
The Committee discussed the value, status and timings of 'in committee' debates in the States Assembly. It was agreed that the Committee's representative to PPC, Deputy Le Hegarat, would relay a proposal that such debates might most effectively be held on a set day, Thursday, of States' meeting weeks. This was intended to ensure greater certainty that appropriate time and attention would be provided to	3. Privileges and Procedures Committee (PPC) Update	
the States Assembly. It was agreed that the Committee's representative to PPC, Deputy Le Hegarat, would relay a proposal that such debates might most effectively be held on a set day, Thursday, of States' meeting weeks. This was intended to ensure greater certainty that appropriate time and attention would be provided to	An update report on the work of PPC was noted.	
4. Legislative Scrutiny	the States Assembly. It was agreed that the Committee's representative to PPC, Deputy Le Hegarat, would relay a proposal that such debates might most effectively be held on a set day, Thursday, of States' meeting weeks. This was intended to ensure greater certainty that appropriate time and attention would be provided to them.	

It was agreed that the Vice-President would serve as the Committee's representative on the Sub-Committee of PPC developing proposals on this matter. 5. Government Plan: Scrutiny Budget 2020 The Committee discussed and agreed the proposed Scrutiny budget for 2020, for submission to PPC as part of the States Assembly's funding requirements in the forthcoming Government Plan. The Committee gave particular attention to the level of funding available to Panels to commission technical expertise and technical market/stakeholder research, which had decreased significantly over the course of several years. Senator Ferguson counselled the Committee about the importance of this budget and the necessity to ensure that it was adequate for all reasonably anticipated circumstances, with a degree of contingency for those that could not be foreseen. Whilst the Committee was in unanimous agreement with that principle, and on all other budget lines, Senator Ferguson registered her concern that the final amount to be submitted in respect of technical assistance (£210,000 p/a) unduly risked being inadequate. 6. Gender Language The Committee considered proposals from the President to encourage the adoption of more appropriately gender conscious titles in respect of the Assembly's Scrutiny Panels. The Committee agreed to progress draft amendments to Standing Orders that would seek to change the name of the Chairmen's Committee to Scrutiny Liaison Committee, and the title of Chairman to Chair. Senator Ferguson dissented from the decision. 7. Arms' Length Organisations (ALOs) The Committee recalled a request that it had made for relevant background information from the Government to help inform its understanding and decision making in this area. Specifically this included a full list of all ALOs, highlighting those whose Memorandum of Understanding or Partnership Agreement was currently under review/revision or known to shortly be subject to such a process. The TO Committee was advised that a response was still awaited, and would be followed up. 8. Review Panels It was noted that legislative drafting of an amendment to Standing Orders regarding the proceedings and status of Review Panels was ongoing. TO 9. Panel Membership Limits The Committee discussed a proposal from the President to increase the limits on the number of States Members permitted to serve on Scrutiny Panels (five), and associated rules such as the number of Panels a Member was allowed to serve on concurrently (two). It was agreed that the proposal would be given further TO consideration when related proposed amendments to Review Panels had been drafted. 10. Liaison Meeting: President/Vice President and Chief Minister

Matters to be raised with the Chief Minister at the forthcoming liaison meeting (1st April, 11am) were agreed. These would include:

- Review Panel changes
- Proposals to update gender nomenclature
- Care of Children in Jersey Review Panel update
- Impact of Policy Development Boards on Scrutiny

 The proposed Target Operating Model for the Growth, Housing and Environment Department

As the President would be unable to attend the meeting, it was agreed that the Vice-President would be accompanied by Deputy Rob Ward. An invitation would also be extended to Connétable Mike Jackson, in particular to make a representation on the final item.

11. Future Meeting

The Committee noted the date of its next scheduled meeting: 2nd May 2019, 10am to 11.45am (Le Capelain Room).

Record of Meeting

Date: 8th May 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore (President)
	Senator Sarah Ferguson
	Connétable Mike Jackson
	Deputy Mary Le Hegarat
	Deputy Rob Ward
Apologies	Deputy Kirsten Morel (Vice-President)
Absent	
In attendance	Tim Oldham, Assistant Greffier: Scrutiny

Agenda matter	Action
1. Minutes	
The Committee approved the records of its meeting held on 28th March 2019.	
2. Panel, PAC & Review Panel Activity Reports	
The Committee noted the activity reports for the Scrutiny Panels, PAC and current Review Panels.	
3. Privileges and Procedures Committee (PPC) Update	
An update report on the work of PPC was noted.	
4. Government Plan: Scrutiny Budget 2020	
The Committee noted correspondence sent to PPC relaying the Committee's proposed Scrutiny budget requirements from the forthcoming Government Plan.	
5. Gender Language	
An update was provided on the progress of draft Standing Order changes to introduce more appropriately gender conscious language within the Assembly's Scrutiny function. The Committee agreed to broaden the scope of the proposed terminology amendments to include all States entities, and once drafted to refer the proposals to PPC.	
6. Review Panels	
The Committee considered a draft amendment to Standing Orders regarding the proceedings and status of Review Panels. Satisfied with the direction of the proposals it agreed to request drafting of a final version that could be approved for lodging. An accompanying report would also be drafted for Committee consideration.	
7. Panel Membership Limits	
The Committee further discussed a proposal from the President to increase the limits on the number of States Members permitted to serve on Scrutiny Panels, and associated rules such as the number of Panels a Member was allowed to serve on concurrently. It was agreed that the proposal should be progressed and legislative	то
drafting of the necessary amendment to Standing Orders was requested. 8. Future Meeting	

The Committee noted the date of its next scheduled meeting: 23rd May 2019, 10am to 11.45am (Le Capelain Room).

Record of Meeting

Date: 4th June 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore (President) Deputy Kirsten Morel (Vice-President) Senator Sarah Ferguson Connétable Mike Jackson Deputy Mary Le Hegarat Deputy Rob Ward
Apologies	
Absent	
In attendance	Tom Walker, Director General Strategic Policy, Performance and Population (SPPP) Megan Mathias, Group Director Policy, SPPP Paul Bradbury, Head of Ministerial Support, Office of the Chief Exceutive Tim Oldham, Assistant Greffier: Scrutiny

Agenda matter	Action
Government Policy Development: Briefing	
The Committee received a briefing from Government officials about transformation of the structure and processes for Government policy development. There was discussion as to how Scrutiny Panels might benefit from the revised approach, for example thorough access to a comprehensive and reliable policy programme which could considerable assist Panels' own work programming. It was agreed that communication would be maintained as the new approach was finalised, and a further briefing would be offered in due course. The Committee thanked the Officers for the information provided and for their time.	

Record of Meeting

Meeting held by electronic mail

Date: 14th June 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore (President)	
	Deputy Kirsten Morel(Vice-President)	
	Senator Sarah Ferguson	
	Connétable Mike Jackson	
	Deputy Mary Le Hegarat	
	Deputy Rob Ward	
Apologies		
Absent		
In attendance	Tim Oldham (Assistant Greffier: Scrutiny)	

Agenda matter	Action
1. Corporate Services Panel: Population and Migration Review	
The Committee approved Terms of Reference and a Scoping Document for the Review.	

Record of Meeting

Meeting held by electronic mail

Date: 17th June 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore (President)
	Deputy Kirsten Morel(Vice-President)
	Senator Sarah Ferguson
	Connétable Mike Jackson
	Deputy Mary Le Hegarat
	Deputy Rob Ward
Apologies	
Absent	
In attendance	Tim Oldham (Assistant Greffier: Scrutiny)

Agenda matter	Action
Education and Home Affairs Panel: Teacher Recruitment and Retention Review	
The Committee approved Terms of Reference and a Scoping Document for the Review.	
2. Review Panel: Transfer of the Ambulance Service and Children and Adolescent Mental Health Service (CAMHS)	
The Committee approved Terms of Reference and a Scoping Document for the Review Panel.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 20th June 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore (President) Deputy Kirsten Morel (Vice-President) Senator Sarah Ferguson Deputy Mary Le Hegarat Deputy Rob Ward
Apologies	Connétable Mike Jackson
Absent	
In attendance	Tom Walker, Director General Strategic Policy, Performance and Population (SPPP) (Item 3 only) Andrew Metcalfe, Director - SPPP (Item 3 only) Tim Oldham, Assistant Greffier: Scrutiny

Agenda matter	Action
1. Minutes	
The Committee approved the records of its meetings held on 8th May and 4th June 2019.	
2. Panel, PAC & Review Panel Activity Reports	
The Committee noted the activity reports for the Scrutiny Panels, PAC and current Review Panels.	
3. Government Plan 2020	
The Committee received a briefing from Government officials about the structure, process and proposed timeframe of the Government Plan. The Committee thanked the Officers for the information provided and for their time.	
4. Gender Language	
The Committee approved a draft Standing Order amendment that sought to introduce more appropriately gender conscious language within the Assembly's Scrutiny function, as well as other States' entities. It was agreed that the President would request the Chairman of the Privileges and Procedures Committee to lodge the draft amendment in the name of his Committee, due to its reach beyond Scrutiny.	
Senator Ferguson maintained her dissent from the proposals.	
5. Review Panels	
The Committee approved an amendment to Standing Orders regarding the proceedings and status of Review Panels, and agreed that it should be lodged accordingly.	то
6. Future Meeting	
The Committee noted the date of its next scheduled meeting: 18th July 2019, 10am to 11.45am (Le Capelain Room).	

Record of Meeting

Meeting held by electronic mail

Date: 5th July 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore (President)	
	Deputy Kirsten Morel(Vice-President)	
	Senator Sarah Ferguson	
	Connétable Mike Jackson	
	Deputy Mary Le Hegarat	
	Deputy Rob Ward	
Apologies		
Absent		
In attendance	Tim Oldham (Assistant Greffier: Scrutiny)	

Agenda matter	Action
1. Review Panel: Care of Children In Jersey	
The Committee approved Terms of Reference and a Scoping Document for the next phase of the Review Panel's work.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 18th July 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore (President)
	Deputy Mary Le Hegarat
	Deputy Rob Ward
	Deputy David Johnson
Apologies	Deputy Kirsten Morel (Vice-President)
	Connétable Mike Jackson
Absent	Senator Sarah Ferguson
In attendance	Tim Oldham, Assistant Greffier: Scrutiny
	Gary Eisner, Scrutiny Officer (Item 4 only)

Agenda matter	Action
1. Minutes	
The Committee approved the records of its meetings held on 14th, 17th and 20th June and 5th July 2019.	
2. Panel, PAC & Review Panel Activity Reports	
The Committee noted the activity reports for the Scrutiny Panels, PAC and all current Review Panels.	
3. Privileges and Procedures Committee (PPC)	
The Committee noted an update on the work of PPC. 4. Government Plan 2020	
4. Government i fan 2020	
The Committee discussed the collective approach of Panels to scrutiny of the Government Plan. It agreed to establish an overarching Review Panel that would incorporate and co-ordinate the work undertaken by each Panel individually. The Committee approved the scoping document and terms of reference for the Review Panel, in addition to a generic scoping document and terms of reference that would be used, adapted as required, by the individual Panels.	
5. Standing Order Amendments	
As previously agreed by the Committee, correspondence sent by the President to the Chairman of PPC in respect of gender-neutral terms in Standing Orders was noted.	
6. Communication with the Scrutiny Membership	
Consideration was held of recent matters raised by a number of Scrutiny members relating to the Committee's work, including appropriate co-ordinated working, scrutiny resources and Panel remits.	
The Committee discussed and agreed improved regular communication initiatives with the wider membership, including:	
a standing item in the style of a 'Chairmen's Committee Activity update' placed on Panel/Committee agendas for the first meeting following a	

Chairmen's Committee meeting. This would include all Panel/PAC activity reports

- an 'Update from the President' style email to the wider membership, as necessary, highlighting matters considered by the Chairmen's Committee at its meetings and/or on relevant matters arising between meetings
- regular invitations to Members, and acceptance of requests from them, to attend Committee meetings in order to raise matters and/or provide feedback on their work - for example those leading Review Panels

Furthermore, the President would liaise with the Chairman of PPC about wider, non-scrutiny specific concerns such as gatherings of all non-Executive Members and Members' resources.

7. Future Meeting

The Committee noted the date of its next scheduled meeting: 26th September 2019, 10am to 11.45am (Le Capelain Room).

Record of Meeting

Date: 26th September 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore (President)
	Senator Sarah Ferguson
	Deputy Mary Le Hegarat
Apologies	Deputy Kirsten Morel (Vice-President)
	Connétable Mike Jackson
Absent	Deputy Rob Ward
In attendance	Tim Oldham, Assistant Greffier: Scrutiny

Agenda matter	Action
1. Minutes	
The Committee approved the records of its meeting held on 18th July 2019.	
2. Panel, PAC & Review Panel Activity Reports	
The Committee noted the activity reports for the Scrutiny Panels, PAC and all current Review Panels.	
3. Privileges and Procedures Committee (PPC)	
The Committee noted an update on the work of PPC, in particular welcoming the initial steps being taken as part of the States Greffe's project to improve the Member's Support service.	
4. Government Plan 2020	
The Committee noted that since it's previous meeting it had approved, by email, Scoping Documents and Terms of Reference for the work of the following Panels in relation to the Government Plan:	
 Care of Children in Jersey (Review Panel) Corporate Services Economic and International Affairs 	
Education and Home Affairs Environment Housing and Infrastructure	
Health and Social SecurityGovernment Plan (Review Panel)	
5. Future Meeting	
The Committee noted the date of its next scheduled meeting: 24th October 2019, 10am to 11.45am (Le Capelain Room).	

Record of Meeting

Meeting held by electronic mail

Date: 10th October 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore (President)
	Deputy Kirsten Morel(Vice-President)
	Senator Sarah Ferguson
	Connétable Mike Jackson
	Deputy Mary Le Hegarat
	Deputy Rob Ward
Apologies	
Absent	
In attendance	Tim Oldham (Assistant Greffier: Scrutiny)

Agenda matter	Action
Education and Home Affairs Panel: Teacher Recruitment and Retention Review	
The Committee approved a revised budget for the Review, agreeing an additional £1,500 for the purpose of focus groups. The total budget for the Review would now be £12,850.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 6th November 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore (President) Deputy Kirsten Morel (Vice-President) Senator Sarah Ferguson Connétable Mike Jackson Deputy Mary Le Hegarat Deputy Rob Ward
Apologies	
Absent	
In attendance	Deputy Geoff Southern (Item 4 only) Tim Oldham, Assistant Greffier: Scrutiny

Agenda matter	Action
	7.0001
1. Minutes	
The Committee approved the records of its meeting held on 26th September and 10th October 2019.	
2. Panel, PAC & Review Panel Activity Reports	
The Committee noted the activity reports for the Scrutiny Panels, PAC and all current Review Panels. The Committee placed on record its thanks for the quality and diligence of the work of the Scrutiny Officers on the Government Plan.	
3. Privileges and Procedures Committee (PPC)	
The Committee noted an update on the work of PPC. The Committee discussed the importance of pro-active, early communication on any matters being worked on by one Committee that affected the other. This point would be relayed to PPC by the Committee's representative, Deputy Mary Le Hegarat.	
Concerns were raised about the absence of adequate training in the roll-out of Office 365 to States Members. It was agreed that the Assistant Greffier would raise the concerns with the States Greffier team with a view to establishing an appropriate programme.	
4. Government Efficiencies Programme: P.88/2019	
The Committee welcomed Deputy Geoff Southern to discuss its approach to the recent approval by the States of P.88/2019, requiring it to 'undertake, commission or oversee' the scrutiny of the potential and actual impact of the proposed efficiency savings on a 6-monthly basis.	
Deputy Southern outlined his vision for scrutiny of the efficiencies programme highlighting an underpinning objective of effective checks and balances. He proposed the establishment of a Review Panel, which would issue a report every 6 months in addition to ongoing work examining the necessary details. It was noted that with finite staff resources, a number of Review Panels already established, and ongoing/planned workloads on the Standing Panels, there would be a need to be consideration given to resource challenges, work prioritisation and sequencing. It	

was agreed that the matter would be discussed again, and a final decision taken, after completion of the upcoming Government Plan debate.

5. Technology Transformation Review Panel

Consideration was given to a proposal by Deputy Kirsten Morel to establish a Review Panel to examine 'technology transformation', in view of the large scale and cross cutting nature of the Government's proposed IT spend and programme. Deputy Morel explained his aspiration to involve a number of informed members of the public in the Panel's work, and a range of options as to how this might best be achieved were considered, such as use of 'expert witnesses' and 'advisers'. It was proposed that the Review Panel would launch its public facing work towards Easter 2020, but that background research and administrative work would begin sooner.

The Committee welcomed the proposal, but agreed to make a final decision in the New Year, when more informed consideration could be given to wider matters of resources, prioritisation and sequencing after the Government Plan debate and the outcome of the re-organisation of the States Greffe

6. Independent Jersey Care Inquiry (IJCI): Two Year Review Report 2019

The Committee considered recommendations relating to scrutiny contained in the report, along with additional matters regarding to the appropriate inclusion of young people in the work of Panels/PAC. It was agreed that an amendment to Standing Orders would be drafted that would place responsibility for scrutiny of children's matters with the Education and Home Affairs Panel. Subject to States approval of the above, the Committee would change the name of the aforementioned Panel to the Children, Education and Home Affairs (CEHA) Panel.

It was further agreed to continue the valuable work of the Care of Children Review Panel, but that it would be requested to assess the merits of updating its Terms of Reference given the passage of time and completion of work by the IJCI, the objective being to ensure its continued relevance and constructive objective influence.

7. Scrutiny Witnesses: Diversity monitoring

Consideration was given to 'best practice' on the matter of diversity monitoring of witnesses providing evidence to Committees in the UK and Scottish parliaments. This included:

- Producing guidance for committees on the processes of selecting witnesses and issuing calls for written evidence
- Producing guidance for organisations providing witnesses to committees
- Improving (online) access to documentation for (particularly first-time) witnesses
- Improving support for (first-time) witnesses
- Careful assessment of the representativeness of 'representative' bodies
- Consistent recording of the gender and other protected characteristics as appropriate of oral witnesses to committees
- Ensuring that there is sufficient time in each inquiry, where possible, for written evidence to be considered before the selection of invitees to give oral evidence
- Exploring the potential benefits of emerging technology as a tool to increase witness diversity

The Committee agreed to explore developing and implementing relevant points of good practice as detailed above, and/or any other related initiatives.

8. All-Scrutiny member meeting and training

It was agreed that options for an all-Scrutiny Member meeting and training during 2020 should be followed-up and progress reported to the Committee.	
9. Future Meeting	
The Committee agreed the date of its next scheduled meeting: 12th December 2019, 10am to 11.45am (Le Capelain Room).	

Record of Meeting

Meeting held by electronic mail

Date: 19th November 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore (President)
	Deputy Kirsten Morel(Vice-President)
	Senator Sarah Ferguson
	Connétable Mike Jackson
	Deputy Mary Le Hegarat
	Deputy Rob Ward
Apologies	
Absent	
In attendance	Tim Oldham (Assistant Greffier: Scrutiny)

Agenda matter	Action
1. Health and Social Security Panel: Jersey Care Model Review	
The Committee approved Terms of Reference and a Scoping Document for the Review.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 12th December 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore (President) Deputy Kirsten Morel (Vice-President) Senator Sarah Ferguson Connétable Mike Jackson Deputy Mary Le Hegarat Deputy Rob Ward
Apologies	
Absent	
In attendance	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone (Item 4 only) Tim Oldham, Assistant Greffier: Scrutiny

Agenda matter	Action
1. Minutes	
The Committee approved the records of its meeting held on 6th (subject to an agreed minor amendment) and 19th November 2019.	
2. Panel, PAC & Review Panel Activity Reports	
The Committee noted the activity reports for the Scrutiny Panels, PAC and all current Review Panels.	
3. Privileges and Procedures Committee (PPC)	
The Committee noted an update on the work of PPC. The Committee agreed to follow up the item regarding how PPC planned to deal with inappropriate communication from members of the public.	то
The President placed on record her discontent about the notice provided to Members about a short-term reduction in the communications capacity within the States Greffe and, further, that work incorporating updates to States Members' email signatures had not progressed as far as expected.	
4. Government Plan: Scrutiny Process	
The Committee welcomed the Connétable of St Martin, Karen Shenton-Stone, to discuss recommendations for improving the receipt of information from the Government during future scrutiny of the Government Plan.	
It was noted that a de-brief on the process co-ordinated by Officers and the Review Panel was in its early stages, and further discussions were imminent. It was agreed that the Connétable's feedback and ideas would be helpfully included within that work. It was envisaged that the Government Plan Review Panel would publish its conclusions at end of that process.	
The Panel thanked the Connétable for her time and contributions. 5. Standing Orders	
The Committee approved draft amendments to Standing Orders on the following matters:	

- a. Increasing the number of Panels on which a Member was permitted to serve, and the maximum membership of a Panel
- b. Extending the remit of the Education and Home Affairs Panel to include children and young people

TO

It was agreed that accompanying reports would be drafted and circulated for approval, in order to enable the subsequent lodging of the proposed amendments for debate early in 2020.

6. Future Meeting

The Committee agreed the dates of its scheduled meetings for 2020 as follows:

- 23rd January
- 27th February
- 26th March
- 23rd April (11.15am 1pm)
- 14th May
- 18th June
- 16th July (11.15am 1pm)
- 24th September
- 22nd October
- 19th November
- 3rd December
- (Opening meeting 2021 21st January)

Record of Meeting

Meeting held by electronic mail

Date: 12th December 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore (President)	-
	Deputy Kirsten Morel(Vice-President)	
	Senator Sarah Ferguson	
	Connétable Mike Jackson	
	Deputy Mary Le Hegarat	
	Deputy Rob Ward	
Apologies		
Absent		
In attendance	Tim Oldham (Assistant Greffier: Scrutiny)	

Agenda matter	Action
Health and Social Security Panel: Jersey Care Model Review	
The Committee approved an updated budget for the Review. The budget for commissioning expert advice was amended from the estimated amount of £20,000 (based on 20 days at £1,000 per day) to £30,000 (based on 24 days at £1,250 per day).	

Record of Meeting

Meeting held by electronic mail

Date: 20th December 2019

Present	Senator Kristina Moore (President)
	Deputy Kirsten Morel(Vice-President)
	Senator Sarah Ferguson
	Connétable Mike Jackson
	Deputy Mary Le Hegarat
	Deputy Rob Ward
Apologies	
Absent	
In attendance	Tim Oldham (Assistant Greffier: Scrutiny)

Agenda matter	Action
Care of Children in Jersey Review Panel: Redress and Accountability Systems	
The Committee approved Terms of Reference and a Scoping Document for the Review. It also noted the updated Terms of Reference providing the framework for the future work of the Review Panel.	